Outline of SAFAR-NLS Course on Social Accountability (July-September 2020)

Course Summary

India has been an enduring puzzle in the study of democracy and development. While the "vibrancy" of Indian democracy has been widely discussed, India's development efforts have been treated with much more skepticism. India's development trajectory has been marked by regular iterations of a range of welfare measures but weak political institutions, overburdened and under-resourced bureaucracies and pervasive inequalities pose significant challenges to the exercise of genuine democratic freedoms. Amongst other things, ensuring the welfare of citizens brings out the contrast between electoral democracy and everyday democracy. Given this seeming incompatibility in India, how do ordinary people hold the state accountable between elections? What are the democratic interfaces through which people engage with the state every day to claim basic entitlements, ask questions and participate in decisions that affect their well-being? What role can these institutions, procedures and mechanisms of accountability play when democracy in contemporary India itself faces fundamental challenges?

This course is rooted in theory that has emerged from practice. It presents a view from the ground, developed through the articulation and practice of everyday engagement by ordinary people. Centering the experiences of social movements that have engaged with or critiqued the state, this course will explore a range of substantive debates around welfare rights and social accountability. It will also draw on empirical work from the disciplines of anthropology, economics, political science, and sociology.

Course objective and learning goals

- 1. To provide students with a critical understanding of current debates on social accountability and their legal, social and political history in India
- 2. To gain insights into some practical examples of citizen-centered social accountability across key sectors, through case studies and interactions with leading activists and practitioners
- 3. To orient students to contemporary challenges to social accountability
- 4. To develop interdisciplinary analytical and practical skills that will be valuable beyond their immediate application to ongoing social accountability projects and new projects that students may want to initiate.

Participation and Assignments

The course will run for 12 weeks and will include 4-5 hours of coursework per week. On week 6,8 and 9, there will be no lectures. These weeks will be dedicated to group work. The course will include 5 seminars which will be a more reflective Q&A between the students and course coordinators. The seminars will also introduce cases of social accountability in action to further ground the ideas discussed in the lecture. Students are expected to attend all classes and to actively participate in discussions and submit weekly responses based on the assigned readings, films, case studies.

We understand that group work will take more than the time assigned in the course, but we hope that by reducing lecture time and by scheduling group work time, students will get be able to engage more deeply with the ideas, practices and readings discussed every week.

Assignments

1. The first assignment is a 7-8 (double space) paged paper on a prompt provided by the course coordinators by 21st July. The first paper will be due by 1st August. Students will receive detailed feedback on argument, content engagement, and writing style/quality.

- 2. The second assignment will be a group assignment where students will pick a theme and apply learnings from the weekly session on unpacking the elements of social accountability within that theme. A 500 word abstract of the group project must be submitted by 25th August. Groups will use the duration of the course to do the research as laid down in Annexure 1, and prepare a presentation for a mini conference which will be held in the last week of class and will be open to the public. The group will also be expected to submit a 10 paged (double spaced) paper based on the presentation for final grades by the 25th of September.
- 3. In addition to these assignments, students shall write <u>250 word</u> reflections on the assigned readings. Each student must choose <u>any five</u> out of ten themes of the session outline to write weekly responses during the course of the semester. For the chosen themes, students should incorporate (but are not limited to) following elements in their response:
 - Analysis of the key arguments presented in the readings
 - Highlight of the critical evidence presented in the readings that support or refute the key arguments
 - Identification of research questions/discussion questions based on the readings as well as relevant personal experiences along with the rationale for these questions
 - At least one question for the speaker/instructor of the class

Reflection papers are due *before* the scheduled classes on Tuesday and Friday. For the class on Tuesday, the paper is due by Sunday 11:59 PM and for the class on Friday, the paper is due by Wednesday 11:59 PM.

The coordinators of the course will be Anindita Adhikari and Rakshita Swamy. Khush Vachhrajani will provide facilitation support for the course. All three are a part of the <u>Social Accountability Forum for Action and Research (SAFAR)</u>.

Evaluation

The class grade will be compiled as follows:

- 30% Participation which includes 250 word reflections, attending discussion seminars and active engagement during lectures
- 30% First Paper
- 40% Group presentation and paper.

Course overview

Module	Topic	Date	Time	Format	Confirmed lecturer
1	Introduction (Part I)	7th July	8:50am-11am	Interactive session	Rakshita Swamy and Anindita Adhikari
	Introduction (Part II)	10th July	11:20- 13:30pm	Interactive session	Rakshita Swamy and Anindita Adhikari
	The State Democracy and Accountability	14th July	17:30pm- 19:30pm	Lecture	Patrick Heller
	Debates on accountability	17th July	11:20am- 13:20pm	Lecture	Yamini Aiyar and Rakshita Swamy

	Trajectory of accountability and rights in India	21st July	8:50am-11am	Lecture	Aruna Roy, Shankar Singh and Anindita Adhikari
2	Rural public service delivery and the anatomy of a social audit	24th July	11:20am- 13:30pm	Lecture	Ashish Ranjan Jha, Village Resource Persons from Social Audit Societies in Bihar and Telangana and Anindita Adhikari
			3pm-4pm: Seminar (1 hour)	Seminar	
	Rural public service delivery and the anatomy of a social audit	28th July	08:50am- 11am	Lecture	Reddy Subrahmanyam and Rakshita Swamy
3	RTI Clinic	31st July	11:20am- 13:30pm	Lecture+Activity	Pankti Jog, Venkatesh Nayak, Angela Rangad, Rawat Ram and Anindita Adhikari
			3pm-4pm	Seminar	
	Social Accountability through and of digital technology	4th August	08:50am- 11am	Lecture	Rajendran Narayan and Rakshita Swamy
4	Exploring accountability of construction workers' rights	7th August	11:20am- 13:30pm	Lecture	Paras Banjara, Ruth Manorama and Rakshita Swamy
			3pm-4pm	Seminar	
	Exploring accountability of workers rights	11th August	08:50am- 11am	Lecture	Babu Mathew and Rakshita Swamy
5	Accountability and the Commons	21st August	11:20am- 13:30pm	Lecture	Jagdeesh Rao and Anindita Adhikari
			3pm-4pm	Seminar	
	Case Study on Mining	25th August	08:50am- 11am	Lecture	Sreedhar Ramamurthy and Rakshita Swamy
	Electoral Bonds	1st September	11:20am- 13:30pm	Lecture	Nitin Sethi
6	Conceptual and legal framework of accountability	8th September	08:50am- 11am	Lecture	Nikhil Dey, Rakshita Swamy and Anindita Adhikari
			3pm-4pm	Seminar	
	Class conference I	22nd September	08:50am- 11am		All lecturers
	Class conference II	25th September	11:20am- 13:30pm		All lecturers

Session 1a: Introduction (Week 1, 2 hours)

This session will focus on introductions to the course, students and instructors. Students will be given an overview of the course, format and requirements and a trailer to the concepts and practices that will be covered in upcoming weeks.

Lecturer: Anindita Adhikari and Rakshita Swamy

Session 1b: Introduction (continued)

This session will focus on introductions to the course, students and instructors. Students will be given an overview of the course, format and requirements and a trailer to the concepts and practices that will be covered in upcoming weeks.

Lecturer: Anindita Adhikari and Rakshita Swamy

Session 2: The state, democracy and accountability (Week 1, 2 hours lecture + 1 hour seminar)

This session will introduce democracy as a link between social and political power or state power and explore its potential and limits. We will ask fundamental questions such as what is the relationship between the state and government and in turn the state, government *and* democracy?

If the state is accepted as a non-negotiable frame of our national political conscience and governments are based on distinct political ideologies and depend on the act of voting then it is perhaps this distinction itself that creates the political and social space for citizen monitoring and therefore accountability. What is the state of democracy in India today? What does the space for public action and accountability look like? Are democracy and accountability synonymous terms?

This session will explore the various forms (thick and thin) of democracy- procedural/formal, participatory and substantive to ask how we can both extend and deepen it. Through this discussion, we will arrive at a working definition of accountability (inspired by Ambedkar's partial exposition on social democracy) as a way to understand democratic deepening.

Key concepts: constitutional democracy, social contract, democracy between elections

Readings:

- 1. Degrees of Democracy: Some Comparative Lessons from India Heller, P. (2000) Degrees of Democracy: Some Comparative Lessons from India, World Politics, Jul., 2000, Vol. 52, No. 4
- 2. Making Space for Civil Society: Institutional Reforms and Local Democracy in Brazil Baiocchi, G., Heller, P., & Silva, M. K. (March 01, 2008). Making Space for Civil Society: Institutional Reforms and Local Democracy in Brazil. Social Forces, 86, 3, 911-936.
- 3. Social Accountability: What Does the Evidence Really Say? Fox, J. A. (August 01, 2015). Social Accountability: What Does the Evidence Really Say?. World Development, 72, 346-361.

Format/structure: Readings and discussion

Lecturers: Patrick Heller, Professor of Sociology and International and Public Affairs, Brown University and Anindita Adhikari, PhD candidate, Department of Sociology, Brown University

Session 3: Debates on accountability (Week 2, 2 hours lecture)

In continuation of the previous week, we will extend the debate on democracy to discuss different types of accountability structures. What are the traditional forms of accountability at the national level (vigilance commissions, audits by the C&AG, Public Interest Litigations), state level (top-down monitoring, department-led audits), local level (panchayati raj structure, nigrani samitis) and how are these different from social accountability mechanisms and institutions? How effective have traditional forms of accountability been and what are the limitations?

Through this discussion, we will arrive at the structure of the Bhilwara Principles which emphasize six elements crucial to the realization of social accountability. These six principles of *jaankaari*, *sunwai*, *karyawahi*, *bhaagidaari*, *suraksha and janata ka manch* seeks to address power inequities by democratizing and decentralizing information and creating institutionalised platforms for people to participate in decision making and oversight

Key concepts: vertical vs horizontal accountability, centralized vs decentralized accountability, bhilwara principles

Readings:

- 1. Jenkins, Rob, and Anne Marie Goetz. 1999. "Accounts and Accountability: Theoretical Implications of the Right-to-Information Movement in India." Third World Quarterly 20(3): 603–622.
- 2. Aiyar, Yamini & Walton Michael (2015). "Rights, Welfare and Citizenship: Evaluating India's Emerging Welfare State", Accountability Initiative, Working Paper, Centre for Policy Research
- 3. Posani, Bala, and Yamini Aiyar. 2009. "State of Accountability: Evolution, Practice and Emerging Questions." In Public Accountability in India. Accountability Initiative Working Paper Series. India: Accountability Initiative.
- 4. Pritchett, Lant. 2013. "Folk and the Formula: Fact and Fiction in Development." 16th Annual Lecture. UNU-WIDER.

Format/structure: Readings and discussion. Presentation on the Bhilwara Framework of Social Accountability and the story of its evolution. This week students will be given a menu of options to develop their class projects around. They can choose from this list or suggest their own.

Lecturers: Rakshita Swamy, Lead, SAFAR and Yamini Aiyar, President, Centre for Policy Research

Session 4: Trajectory of accountability and rights in India (Week 2, 2 hours lecture + 1 hour seminar)

In this session, we will move from theories of state, democracy and accountability to its concrete instantiation in the Indian context. This session will introduce students to the history of the struggles for rights-based welfare in India and the introduction of rights-based laws such as RTI, NREGA and NFSA which also marked a paradigm shift in how we understand social accountability. The Forest Rights Act (FRA) will also be discussed as a point of contrast to the above laws. We will take a long view of the struggles for rights including those that have had limited "legislative" success.

Key concepts: Social movements and the state/government, public action and deliberation, legal and institutional frameworks, rights-based welfare and social accountability

Readings:

- 1. The Non-Party Political Process by Rajni Kothari PRAXIS International, Vol. 5, No. 3 (1985)
- 2. Social Activism, Political Processes, and Rights Legislation by Zoya Hasan
- 3. The RTI Story Chapter 8 to 12
- 4. Democratic Assertions: The Making of India's Recognition of Forest Rights Act by Kundan Kumar and John M. Kerr

Format/structure: Film, reading and discussion.

Lecturers: Aruna Roy, Shankar Singh, Founder Members, Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan (MKSS) and Anindita Adhikari

Session 5: Rural public service delivery and the anatomy of a social audit (Week 3, 2 hours lecture)

This session will be interactive and based on a close engagement with the micro dynamics of a social audit. The anatomy of a social audit provides a powerful window into the landscape and life cycle of social security in rural India (with a specific focus on food, pensions and work), claiming entitlements and the concepts of deliberation and disputing. This session will unpack social audit through a discussion on who is making claims of the government, what are the enabling and constraining conditions in rural settings, what are the different structures and flow of information, who facilitates, what is the role of panchayats and so on.

Key Concepts: Basic entitlements vs rights, public hearings, participation, collective platforms

Readings:

- 1. Caste, Class, and Audits Rajesh Veeraraghavan (Not available for circulation yet)
- 2. Social Audits in Andhra Pradesh: A Process in Evolution Karuna Vakati Aakella, Sowmya Kidambi

Format/structure: Students will be asked to watch a 30 min video of jun sunwai and answer a set of questions that captures various aspects of this exercise such as the role of records and information (digital/non digital), public hearing norms, the role of panchayat functionaries, claims, complaints and disputes, how resolution is arrived, what social audit reports look like and so on.

Lecturers: Village Resource Persons of State Social Audit Societies in Bihar, Telengana, Ashish Ranjan Jha, Social Activist, Jan Jagran Shakti Sangathan (JJSS) and Anindita Adhikari

Session 6: Rural public service delivery and the anatomy of a social audit (continued) (Week 3, 2 hours lecture + 1 hour seminar)

This session will continue to look at the trajectory of the institutionalization of social audits through mandates set forward by Government, Judiciary and the C&AG, amongst its expanding scope beyond rural public service delivery.

Key concepts: Social audits and its operational details

Readings:

- 1. Auditing Standards for Social Audit (CAG)
- 2. Manual for Social Audit Meghalaya Social Audit Law
- 3. Social Audit Action Taken Report Meghalaya Society For Social Audit & Transparency

Format/structure: Lecture and presentations

Lecturers: Rakshita Swamy and R. Subrahmanyam, Secretary, Union Ministry of Social Justice and Welfare, Government of India

Session 7: RTI clinic (Week 4, 3 hours interactive lecture and interaction)

This will be an immersive two hour clinic in which students will learn the provisions of the RTI law and will draft and file RTI applications. Activists, journalists and researchers that have filed prominent RTI applications will be invited to discuss their questions, how they formulated the questions, the filing and appeal process, and how the information has contributed to public discourse and in holding government accountable.

Readings:

- 1. Adjudicating the RTI Act: Analysis of orders of the Central Information Commission Satark Nagrik Sangathan and Centre for Equity Studies
- 2. People's monitoring of the RTI regime in India (2011-2013) by RTI assessment and advocacy group, and Centre for Equity Studies
- 3. RTI Act, 2005

Format/structure: Presentation, discussion of draft RTI and live demonstration of filing an RTI application

Lecturers: Pankti Jog, Activist, Mahiti Adhikar Gujarat Pahel; Venkatesh Nayak, Programme Coordinator, Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative; Angela Rangad, Member, Meghalaya Right to Information Movement; Rawat Ram, Activist, Soochna Evum Rozgar Adhikar Abhiyan and Anindita Adhikari

<u>Session 8: Social Accountability through and of digital technology (Week 4, 2 hour lecture + 1 hour seminar)</u>

The last two decades have seen the changing form that digital technology and data have played in our social, political and economic lives. This session will critically look at the role that digital technology has assumed in social policy. The session will introduce some contemporary innovations that have been rolled in the planning, implementation, funding and evaluation of key social welfare schemes in the name of "good governance"- use of management information systems and public finance management systems, creation of databases and their interoperability, aadhaar and direct benefit transfers. The costs and benefits of these innovations will be debated based on evidence of denial of entitlements and social exclusions on one hand and examples of how technology can enable and expand access to entitlements when designed and driven by users themselves. This section will highlight instances when digital technology can actually enable citizens to access their rights, to know and to demand accountability. Examples include democratizing registration of demand for work under MGNREGA through technological means, webbased platforms such as Rajasthan's Jan Soochna Portal and Karnataka's Mahiti Kanaja through which information on welfare programs is made transparent, eligible beneficiaries are identified and enrolled, activists and civil society organizations can use its dashboards to monitor implementation and strengthen the ecosystem for accountability.

Readings:

- 1. Impact of Aadhaar on Welfare Programmes Reetika Khera
- 2. Who is responsible when technology fails the marginalized? Sakina Dhorajiwala

Format and Structure: Presentations on "innovations" mentioned above including listening to testimonies from people who have faced the brunt of digital technology violating their rights. The session will include a live demonstration of the Jan Soochna Portal. The role played by Information and Facilitation Centers like the Sahayta Kendras in Jharkhand that facilitate ordinary citizens to use publicly available information and demand accountability at the lowest level will also be explored. A brief glimpse of a grievance redress architecture based on digital technology i.e. Rajasthan Sampark, along with a discussion about ongoing efforts to make this digital architecture work for its end-users.

Lecturers: Rajendran Narayanan, Assistant Professor, Azim Premji University and Rakshita Swamy

Session 9: Exploring accountability of construction workers' rights (Week 5, 2 hour lecture presentation)

Workers walking back from cities to their homes hundreds and thousands of kilometers away, will be the most enduring images of the covid-19 lockdown for years to come. This exodus of migrants from our cities raises many uncomfortable questions to us and the government about how we treat our workforce. One of these, the plight of construction workers becomes particularly salient, given their role in building the very flyovers they were compelled to walk on in order to get home by foot. This session will throw some light on what the State's accountability to construction workers is in theory, and how it pans out in reality. Apart from giving a brief overview of the size and role of construction workers in the economy, it will also include a brief history of a peoples' campaign for the passage of the Building and other Construction Workers (BoCW) Act. The session will conclude with an exercise of social audit that was conducted of the BoCW Act in different parts of the country, and the lessons it threw up for steering any further efforts for improving accountability of the State to its construction workers.

Key concepts: labor and precarity in urban India, accountability for informal workforce, labor codes and laws such as BoCW Act

Readings:

- 1. Building and Other Construction Workers Act
- 2. Supreme Court's Judgment on National Campaign Committee for Central Legislation on Construction Labour (NCC-CL) vs Union of India & Ors.

Format/structure: Overview presentation on key facts related to construction workers, discussion on conditions of construction workers in cities, lecture on trajectory of the campaign for passage of BoCW Act and social audits of BoCW Act. What does it take even after a social audit to have administration take corrective action on social audit findings and deal with question of how to deal with private entities engaged with service delivery (such as Common Service Centers) when seeking accountability from the State.

Lecturers: Paras Banjara, Member, Social Accountability Forum for Action and Research (SAFAR); Ruth Manorama, National Convenor, National Federation for Dalit Women (TBC) and Rakshita Swamy

Session 10: Exploring accountability of workers' rights (Week 5, 2 hour lecture + 1 hour seminar)

Construction workers are just one distinct category of workers in the Indian work force. Hawkers and street-vendors, agricultural workers, factory and boiler workers, mine workers, workers of the platform based economy (Zomato, Uber, Ola, Urban Company etc), loaders, sanitation workers, waste pickers, drivers are just some of the other categories within the broader segment of organized and the unorganized workers. These are also the workers who were most affected by the lockdown on account of COVID-19. This session will explore the recent "reform" of introducing four Central Labour Codes in place of 44 sector and issue specific central labor laws. The session will attempt to develop a critical understanding of the Labour Codes along with understanding what the shift from status quo to the Codes entails, and what the gains and losses to accountability are as a result of these changes. It will also juxtapose the trajectory of the "reform agenda" in this case, with the rights-based reform agenda studied in Week 4.

Key concepts: labour rights

Readings:

- 1. Brief Comments on Code on Wages, 2019 and the Draft Rules recently proposed for its implementation Prepared by the Centre for Labour Studies at NLSIU, Bengaluru
- 2. Preliminary Notes on the Four Labour Codes Compiled by the Centre for Labour Studies at NLSIU, Bengaluru
- 3. New Wine in a Refurbished Bottle? Reading the Industrial Relations Code Bill 2019 alongside historic labour jurisprudence Prepared at the Centre for Labour Studies at NLSIU, Bengaluru
- 4. The Code on Social Security, 2019 (Ninth Report) by the Standing Committee on Labour (2019-20, Seventeenth Lok Sabha)
- 5. Aspiring for a Just Social Security Law for India Prepared by the Centre for Labour Studies at NLSIU, Bengaluru

Format and structure: Lecture presentations and discussion

Lecturers: Babu Mathew, Professor, National Law School of India University and Rakshita Swamy

Session 11: Accountability and the commons (Week 7, 2 hour lecture)

This session attempts to place the accountability debate within the broader context of ecological security, which has implications for both conservation of nature and protection of livelihoods. Students will be introduced to existing legal provisions that govern the management and ownership of commons which includes land, forests, and water. By laying out the trajectory of governance of commons in India, the session will explore conceptual and operational questions of how accountability manifests in a paradigm where natural resources are owned by citizens and the State plays the role of a trustee.

Readings:

- 1. The Myth of the Tragedy of the Commons by Ian Angus
- 2. "One World in which Many Worlds Fit" On the Commons (Article)
- 3. Many Faces of Madness (Short Film) https://youtu.be/FKQUyThMQ-g
- 4. Baphlimali (Short Film) https://youtu.be/p1c54Ktm-1U

Format/Structure: Film, reading, discussion

Lecturers: Jagdeesh Rao, Chief Executive, Foundation for Ecological Security and Anindita Adhikari

Session 12: Case study (Week 7, 2 hour presentation and interaction)

This session will involve a deep dive into understanding efforts to hold an ongoing mining operation accountable to statutory norms and needs of the local community, through a case study.

Lecturers: Sreedhar Ramamurthy, Founder, Environics Trust and Rakshita Swamy

Readings:

- 1. Situation Analysis and Claim Status World Bank Funded East Parej Coal Project Environics Trust mines, minerals and PEOPLE Samatha, Supported by Global Greengrant Funds (2006)
- 2. Environmental Democracy in The Himalayas An assessment of Access to Information, Public Participation, and Access to Justice in Himachal Pradesh and Uttarakhand by Ritwick Dutta and R. Sreedhar
- 3. Polavaram Dam A critical view on ecological governance by Environics Trust

Guest lecture on electoral bonds (public lecture) (Week 8)

The course has so far explored elements of social accountability from the perspective of the relationship between the citizen and the State. This public lecture will unpack what the implications of political funding on political accountability, and thereby explore elements of social accountability from the perspective of the relationship between the voter and the State.

Speaker: Nitin Sethi, Journalist

Readings:

- 1. Crony Capitalism and India's Political System. Rajeev Gowda and Nandan Sharalaya
- 2. Democracy and Development in India: A Comparative Perspective. Pranab Bardhan. University of Berkley
- 3. The Billionaire Raj: A Journey Through India's New Gilded Age. Interview with author, James Crabtree [Video]
- 4. Jaane Bhi Do Yaaro (Film)

Session 13: Conceptual and legal framework of accountability (Week 9, 2 hour lecture + 1 hour seminar)

The course so far would have given students a glimpse of the different elements of accountability at play, in the midst of the various pushes and pulls of an inequitable democracy. Do these elements contradict each other? Or are there commonalities that emerge? This session revisit the Bhilwara Framework of Social Accountability and discuss them in more detail. The framework has emerged from citizens and collectives that face the unjust violations of social accountability on a daily basis and has moved in its journey from a public campaign into a draft bill. Through this presentation, students will be invited to discuss and critically analyse the framework and Bill through their individual and collective understanding from the course so far.

Key concepts: Explore a conceptual understanding of social accountability and its manifestation into Law

Readings:

- 1. Dr. Ambedkar's Last Speech in The Constituent Assembly On Adoption Of The Constitution (November 25, 1949)
- 2. Explorations in The Concept of Social Accountability: From Theory to Practice by Rakshita Swamy (CBGA)

Format/structure: The session will then translate to how minimum principles of a framework translated into legal provisions in various laws and policies. We will compare the framework and provisions of different laws such as Bihar's Public Grievance Redress Law, Rajasthan's Right to Hearing Act, Right to Public Service Acts of select states with the Draft Social Accountability Bill currently being advocated for by the MKSS and the SR Abhiyan.

Lecturer: Nikhil Dey, Founder Member, Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan (MKSS); Anindita Adhikari and Rakshita Swamy

Session 14a: Mini conference I (Week 11, 2 hours)

In this session, students will make group presentation. All the speakers and resource persons who contributed to the course will be invited to attend and provide feedback. The session will end with some comments from resource persons and a discussion on critiques of social accountability, victories and unanswered questions

Session 14b: Mini conference II (Week 11, 2 hours)

In this session, students will make group presentation. All the speakers and resource persons who contributed to the course will be invited to attend and provide feedback. The session will end with some comments from resource persons and a discussion on critiques of social accountability, victories and unanswered questions

Annexure 1

Students can choose one of the following cases (maximum of 5 students per theme) or add their own:

- i. Domestic work and workers
- ii. Government School
- iii. Government Primary Health Centre
- iv. Street vendors and hawkers
- v. Sanitation work and workers
- vi. Drinking Water
- vii. Waste management

For the chosen themes students will be required to research the following aspects related to the chosen theme:

- i. What are the rights of different stakeholders?
- ii. What was the evolution of the rights? Was it a result of Government policy, people's campaigns, judicial interventions, obligations to meet international covenants or something else? What were the key benchmarks of this evolution?
- iii. What are the formal/statutory provisions for accountability?
- iv. What component of the Bhilwara Framework are operational and which ones are absent?
- v. What will a social audit in this case entail? What information would have to be shared before a social audit? Who should be present in a social audit public hearing? Where should the hearing take place?
- vi. What would an icon for this theme look like on the Mahiti Kanaja/Jan Soochna Portal?

Students will be required to undertake the following activities as well:

- i. Interact with the most affected stakeholder at the point of service delivery, and observe the conditions under which they are able to accessing their entitlements or not.
- ii. Visit a local implementation office and observe which component of the Bhilwara Framework was operational or missing.
- iii. Look through the Jan Soochna Portal and Mahiti Kanaja and observe whether relevant information related to the chosen theme is disclosed. This will include listing of the nature of information that should be disclosed, based on an understanding of the theme developed by the student through the study
- iv. Help an affected stakeholder file a complaint through the official channel and Sakala and also list the nature of complaints being faced by stakeholders
- v. File an RTI